

Clause No. 10 in Report No. 5 of Committee of the Whole was adopted, without amendment, by the Council of The Regional Municipality of York at its meeting held on November 21, 2013.

**10**  
**PURCHASE OF THREE REAR SLIDE-IN SANDING UNITS  
FOR WINTER MAINTENANCE ACTIVITIES  
(REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL P-13-112)**

**Committee of the Whole recommends adoption of the following recommendation contained in the report dated October 29, 2013 from the Acting Commissioner of Transportation and Community Planning:**

**1. RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that:

1. Council authorize entering into a contract with Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. for the supply and delivery of three rear slide-in sanding units, at a total cost of \$248,412 exclusive of taxes, in accordance with RFP-13-112.

**2. PURPOSE**

This report seeks Council authorization to enter into a contract with Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. to supply three Epoke Sirius AST (“Epoke”) rear slide-in sanding units for use by the Roads Branch for winter maintenance activities.

In accordance with the Region’s Purchasing Bylaw, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the highest scoring proposal is not the proposal with the lowest overall cost.

**3. BACKGROUND**

**York Region owns three new dump trucks which are designed to carry rear slide-in sanding units**

In 2012, the Region purchased four Freightliner dump trucks complete with snow plows for winter maintenance. These units were designed to carry rear slide-in sanding units and three are currently unable to spread sand or salt as part of winter operations. These new

trucks were purposely not outfitted with integrated sand/salt spreading capability in order to extend the life of the trucks. Trucks with integrated sand/salt boxes are subject to additional wear and tear as the boxes are used to carry various materials such as gravel, stones, etc. during non-winter maintenance activities. In 2012, the Region purchased one Epoke rear slide-in sanding unit from Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. This removable unit allowed for the spreading of sand or salt across multiple lanes and was the first unit of its kind used by the Roads Branch for winter maintenance. The slide-in unit is then stored during the non-winter season and is not subject to additional wear and tear.

Based on the success and ease of use of this unit, a Request for Proposal was developed to purchase three additional slide-in sanding units to be used in the remaining three dump trucks purchased in 2012. Funds were allocated for these units through the 2013 budget process.

#### **4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS**

##### **Performance, reliability and maintainability are important considerations in the purchase of specialized equipment**

In the past, the procurement of vehicles and equipment has been accomplished through the use of tenders resulting in awards based solely on pricing. This has been problematic because the low bid approach resulted in equipment being purchased that did not meet the needs of the users. In order for staff to evaluate equipment on its technical merits and other beneficial factors, such as maintenance, safety, training, delivery etc., the purchase of these three slide-in sanding units followed a Request for Proposal (RFP) process.

Although removable sanding units are increasingly common in other jurisdictions, in 2013 the Region acquired its first slide-in sanding unit, an Epoke from Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. This unit provided the opportunity for Roads staff, both operators and maintenance technicians, to gauge the effectiveness of this technology application on our road system. This was an important process component as it helped confirm the equipment's actual benefits in the field. This process also helped to inform the budget estimate and guide the development of the proposal's specifications.

##### **The RFP evaluation process included a mandatory product demonstration to help evaluate the overall value of the equipment**

Through the RFP process, the proposals were evaluated based on a weighting of 80 per cent for the technical component and 20 per cent for the financial component.

The technical proposals were evaluated using the following criteria:

- Product Demonstration - To allow for the evaluation of operational ease, effectiveness, equipment maintainability, corrosion prevention and safety features
- Qualifications and Experience - Including the capacity of the firm to provide service, on-site support and provide local parts supply, as well as references
- Project Deliverables - Including firm delivery date, operator and maintenance technician training
- Value Added Services – Items of value and benefit to the Region beyond the scope of the specifications
- Safety Features – For the operator incorporated into the design of the unit
- Warranty

**The proposal submitted by Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. is the clear choice based on the overall evaluation**

Table 1 shows the total scores for all bids.

**Table 1**  
Evaluation Summary

<b>Company</b>	<b>Technical Score (Out of 80)</b>	<b>Financial Score (Out of 20)</b>	<b>Combined Score</b>	<b>Total Price</b>
Joe Johnson Equipment Inc.	65.10	17.16	82.27	\$248,412
Amaco Equipment	56.90	20.00	76.90	\$213,183*
S&B Services (steel unit)	44.00	n/a	n/a	n/a
S&B Services (stainless steel unit)	44.50	n/a	n/a	n/a

- Notes: 1) Total required score to advance to Price Evaluation (Envelope B): 48 points or 60%.  
2) n/a - Did not pass technical component and financial envelope returned unopened.  
3) \* This includes two options (stainless steel hopper and upgraded pump) required to meet the RFP specifications and to allow for an equitable product comparison.

In accordance with the terms of the RFP, if a proposal received a technical evaluated score less than 60 per cent, the proposal would not proceed to the evaluation of the pricing. This was the case for the proposals submitted by S&B Services.

**Fleet Services staff are familiar with Epoke and have a long-standing relationship with Joe Johnson Equipment Inc.**

An added benefit of the proposal from Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. is that Fleet Services staff are familiar with the operation and maintenance requirements of the Epoke product. Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. has maintenance facilities and factory technicians within the Region who will be able to assist Regional staff to minimize equipment downtime. Fleet Services already maintain several pieces of equipment supported by Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. including:

- Elgin street sweepers
- Madvac litter collection units
- Tiger mowers

The design of the Epoke unit incorporates many operator safety features including:

- Spring-assisted lifting devices
- Pinch-point reduction
- Safe operator inspection access

The submission from Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. offered several value-added benefits to the Region beyond what was required within the specifications. These items provided at no additional cost include:

- Four years of operator snow school training.
- Four years of calibration support.
- Four years of Fleet Technician training.
- One Eposat system at no cost for one season.
- Ongoing Management and Supervisor one-on-one support.

**The proposal included a commitment to a three-week delivery time which will allow the units to be used for the upcoming winter season**

Proponents were advised within the RFP that a firm delivery date would be an important evaluation criterion. Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. indicated in their proposal that they would be able to provide delivery within three weeks following the issuance of a purchase order. This immediate delivery will allow for the use of this equipment through the 2013/2014 winter season, greatly benefiting the Region.

## **5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

There is sufficient funding in the 2013 budget for the purchase of three rear slide-in sanding units, at a total cost of \$248,412.

## **6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT**

This equipment will be used for winter maintenance of all Regional roads within the municipality.

## **7. CONCLUSION**

The award of proposal P-13-112 to Joe Johnson Equipment Inc. will complement the current Epoke unit currently being used by the Roads maintenance division. The almost immediate delivery of the three units will allow for this equipment to be fully utilized through the 2013/2014 winter season. Additionally, the value-added elements including four years of on-going training will ensure that this equipment is used to its maximum potential.

For more information on this report, please contact Brian Titherington, Director, Roads Branch, at Ext. 5901.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.